

**None for One:
Examination Influences on Presidential Private Bill Vetoes**

**Samuel B. Hoff
Delaware State University**

Introduction

This study examines factors associated with the American president's rejection of private bills, defined as legislation dealing with individual matters such as claims against the government, immigration and naturalization cases, land titles, and military pensions. While previous research has analyzed various influences on public bill vetoes and on congressional overriding actions, there has been less focus on private bill vetoes by presidents. Most scholars regard private bills as less important than public bills—which relate to general affairs and normally impact a large number of people—and view the utilization of the presidential veto against private bills as arbitrary and mundane. Conversely, this writer believes that private bill vetoes have served as a vital, if under-appreciated, tool in the president's arsenal of powers.

There are a plethora of reasons for focusing on vetoes of private bills. First, there has been twice the number of private bills rejected by chief executives as public bills in U.S. history under the Constitution. Second, because private bills have the same procedural requirements for becoming law as public bills, there are definite policy implications of their passage, regardless of the number of people that they affect. Finally, it is likely that many of the same catalysts of public bill vetoes are at work when presidents object to private legislation. In an effort to confirm the latter hypothesis, the present work develops an empirical

model containing three categories of variables, labeled as personal, institutional and environmental (PIE).

After delineating functions of private bills together with reviewing their development, the PIE model is employed to systematically investigate presidential private bill veto trends over the span of a century, 1869 to 1969, encompassing eighteen presidential administrations and fifty Congresses. The research substantiates the purposeful nature of presidential private bill veto issuance as well as the benefits of the device for challenging suspect legislative initiatives.

Private Bill Functions and Development

According to Richard Beth (1995: 1627), “private bills rest on practices of the British parliament that have roots in Roman law.” Under American law, the statutory definition includes all bills for the relief of private parties, bills granting pensions, bills removing political disabilities, and bills for the survey of rivers and harbors. Additional categories include private bills excepting individuals from certain immigration and naturalization requirements (“Private Bills in Congress” 1966), correcting military service records, and permitting citizens to accept foreign honors (Beth 1995). Marc Yacker (1979: 5) observes that “[t]hroughout the 19th and well into the 20th Century the majority of private bills concerned pensions for veterans and their wives, and relief for those from whom the Government had made a claim. Questions of military status (discharge, rank, salary, etc.) were also entertained.”

Like public bills and joint resolutions, private bills must be approved by both chambers of Congress in identical form, then either be signed by the president or enacted over his veto. However, changes in procedures for dealing with private bills have occurred throughout American history. Beth (1995: 1626) asserts that by “1810 the House had established special procedures for private bills; from 1839, private bills were listed on a separate calendar; and from 1900, practices were instituted that allowed one objection to block passage.”

Richard Watson (1993) reviews other actions pertaining to private bills. The Court of Claims was established in 1855 to recommend action on private bills. The powers of that court were expanded in 1883 and 1887. A 1962 Supreme Court decision prohibited the Court of Claims from issuing non-binding advisory opinions, after which the latter court refused to take any more congressionally referred cases. A 1946 section of the Legislative Reorganization Act shifted responsibility for dealing with pensions and military records to executive branch agencies or the U.S. district courts. Congress enacted laws in 1957 and 1958 which authorized the attorney general of the Justice Department to handle most immigration appeals. Finally, a 1966 law transferred remaining tort claim responsibility to the executive branch.

Yacker (1979) discovers that the number of private bills enacted reached its peak in the early part of the 20th Century, declined thereafter, and stabilized after 1968. Jeffrey Hill and Kenneth Williams (1993: 1017) hold that “the explanation for the decline in private claims bills is quite simple: legislators no longer see claims bills as an advantageous opportunity.” The pattern of private bill vetoes by U.S. presidents differs in several ways from that of public bill vetoes. First, chief executives did not begin to reject such legislation regularly until after the Civil War. Whereas there were fifty-five regular vetoes of public bills from 1789-1869, only five private bills were vetoed by regular means. In fact, Carlton Jackson (1967: 135) states that President “Grant established the precedent by which private bills would be handled.” A second distinction, caused by the revisions in private bill practice delineated above, is that there have been only five presidential vetoes of private bills since 1969, while 166 public bills were rejected by regular means between 1969 and 1997 (Hoff 2001). Nevertheless, overall there have been almost twice the number of private bill vetoes by regular means as public bill vetoes and about a third more pocket vetoes of private bills than public bills (*Presidential Vetoes, 1789-1988* 1992; *Presidential Vetoes, 1989-1996* 1997). Jackson describes trends in presidential private bill veto use:

... most of the vetoes from 1870 to 1945 were on private bills of one sort or another. The greatest numbers came, of course, under Grover Cleveland and Franklin D. Roosevelt. On the whole, these vetoes reflected the desire of Presidents to guard the Treasury against unwarranted intrusions, since it was estimated by the *Courant* that twenty-five percent of claims were fraudulent. The vetoes, too, sometimes reflected the political battles between Republicans and Democrats, or among factions within one party (Jackson 1967: 135).

Robert Spitzer (1987) finds that few public bills have been rejected since the 1950s.

A final distinction in private-public bill veto patterns is that due to their content and procedures adopted to check the merit of claims, only seven private bill vetoes have been overridden in American history, less than one percent of all such bills approved by Congress. On the other hand, the controversial, political, and broader nature of public bills has led to ninety-five overrides, or almost 20 percent of such bills since the presidency of George Washington. Jackson (1967: 135) explains the reasons for private bill veto behavior:

Possibly one reason for so many private bill vetoes is that the lawmakers rarely refused to sponsor a bill for one of their constituents, although they fully expected a presidential veto. Thus, the President would suffer the onus of having prevented a pension, while the congressman would gain support for at least having tried to secure passage of the bill. This may also explain Congress' failure even to reconsider the vast majority of such vetoed legislation (Jackson 1967: 135).

Berdahl (1937: 531) finds that “private bills are passed in default of serious opposition rather than because of enthusiastic affirmative support.” Spitzer (1987: 82) explains that when a recommendation to veto a private bill is made by

an executive department, “it is perceived, in many ways, as a nonpartisan judgment, unlike most public-bill vetoes.”

Studying Private Bill Veto Use

Several scholars postulate why so few studies of presidential private bill veto employment have been undertaken. As early as 1907 (247), Asher Hinds notes the confusion in classifying public and private bills: “The line of distinction between public and private bills is so difficult to be defined in many cases that it must rest on the opinion of the Speaker and the details of the bill.” Frederick Taylor (1971: 37) identifies “the practice, at various periods in American history, to enact omnibus claims and omnibus pension bills” as another cause of confusion in classifying bills. Bruce Peabody (1999: 21) contends that before Congress officially identified private bills in 1936, “it proved difficult to distinguish private from public bills prior to this date.”

Other arguments for the dearth of research on private bill vetoes criticize the content of legislation. Spitzer (1987) believes that both fear of setting a negative precedent and the narrow concerns covered in a private bill result in Congress deferring to the president. Albert Ringelstein (1989: 61) propagates that “public bills are more interesting when analyzing justification and policy content than private ones.” Most veto studies over the last twenty-five years have limited analysis to regular public bill vetoes (Copeland 1983; Rohde and Simon 1985; Hoff 1991; Watson 1993; Shields and Huang 1995; Hoff 2001); a few combine regular and pocket vetoes of public bills (Woolley 1991; Lewis and Strine 1996); and one examines pocket vetoes of public bills exclusively (Hoff 1994). When private bill vetoes have been the focus, they are examined in a mixed sample with public bills (Lee 1975; Simonton 1987).

PIE Model of Private Bill Vetoes

If obstacles to defining private bill vetoes can be removed, we would have a rich source of data to utilize. Similarly, if present stereotypes positing a one-way relationship involving private bill vetoes were eliminated, we would view

such vetoes as a vital policy tool of chief executives throughout most of American history. The PIE model of private bill veto employment accomplishes both of the latter objectives. To ensure a pure sample, this study includes only regular private bill vetoes involving individuals. Second, the analysis spans the century from the Ulysses Grant through the Lyndon Johnson administration, 1869 to 1969, which is “particularly appropriate in the case of private bill vetoes” (Taylor (1971: 38).

The PIE model agrees with the assumption that Congress largely defers to the president on decisions pertaining to private bill vetoes. However, the model rejects the notion that the president’s action is wholly objective or automatic. Instead, the chief executive's propensity to issue private bill vetoes and their frequency, per year is the result of personal, institutional, and environmental factors regarding his relationship with Congress. According to the PIE model, presidents treat private bill vetoes much as they would an item veto emanating from a public bill.

Of course, item veto authority was only granted to one president--Bill Clinton--who utilized it eighty-three times on eleven appropriations bills over almost two years before the law permitting it was declared unconstitutional by the Supreme Court (Hoff 1999). The PIE model of private bill veto behavior contains two variables under the personal category, including the military background of the president and term which the chief executive is serving; three variables under the institutional area, encompassing a number of annual private laws, party control of Congress in relation to the president, and yearly public bills vetoed by regular means; and four environmental variables—business failure rate, change in personnel involving certain cabinet secretaries, whether a war is taking place, and when a federal election occurs. Using the year as the unit of analysis and examining private bill veto behavior from 1869-1969, we have 100 cases. The measurement of the variables and hypotheses about the direction of influence are found in Table 1.

The PIE model represents the first known effort to empirically investigate influences on private bill vetoes. We will analyze what leads to the issuance of regular private bill vetoes together with factors influencing number of regular private bill vetoes annually. Because the first dependent variable above is dichotomous, probit analysis is tapped to evaluate the model. The first equation is as follows:

Probability of private bill veto employment by regular means (Y= I)= Constant +B1 (president's military background) + B2 (term of president) + B3 (number of annual private laws) + B4 (party control of Congress) + B5 (number of annual regular public bill vetoes) + B6 (business failure rate) + B7 (cabinet change) + B8 (war) + B9 (election) + error.

In the second part of the empirical study, the dependent variable is number of annual private bill vetoes by regular means. Because this dependent variable is discrete, bounded by zero, and is based on an event count, poisson regression is the most appropriate statistical technique. Todd Shields and Chi Huang (1995: 565) note that poisson method “assumes that the probability of an event occurring at any instant is consistent within a period and independent of all previous events during that period.” The equation for the second segment of the analysis is:

EV (expected number of yearly private bill vetoes by regular means) = e/n (exposure) X [BO (constant) + B1x1 (president's military background) + B2x2 (term) + B3x3 (annual private laws) + B4x4 (party control) + B5x5 (annual regular public bill vetoes) + B6x6 (business failure rate) + B7x7 (cabinet change) + B8x8 (war) + B9x9 (election) + error].

Results

Table 2 illustrates the frequency of regular private bill vetoes by presidents over the century span from 1869-1969, furnishing both overall totals

and annual averages. The total number in the sample is 680, which is about three-fourths of the overall number of private bill vetoes identified by two independent sources (Taylor 1971; Spitzer 1987). The list of private bill vetoes in the PIE model appears in the Appendix.

The annual average of private bill vetoes by presidents found in Table 2 shows that the first Grover Cleveland administration had the highest number between 1869-1969 (67.50), followed by the back-to-back presidencies of Franklin Roosevelt (15.83) and Harry Truman (10.50). Only one president, Warren Harding, declined to reject any private bills involving individuals. Yearly, presidents over the latter century averaged 6.8 such vetoes, almost three more than the average annual number of public bill vetoes over the same span (3.9).

Table 3 depicts the thirty-one years when no regular private bill vetoes pertaining to individuals were issued by American chief executives. It is fascinating to discover that every president from Ulysses Grant through William Taft--nine in succession--refrained from releasing any private bill vetoes during their first year in office. Because this phenomenon occurs across parties and partisan control of Congress, it cannot be dismissed as coincidence. On the other hand, the longest span of consecutive yearly private bill vetoes by presidents transpires over the eighteen years from 1934 to 1952, followed by the fourteen-year period from 1953 to 1967.

These data verify that private bill veto use remained steady in the last third of the century in which they are examined. Table 4 displays the results from the first test of the PIE model, intended to discover catalysts of initial veto issuance. The dichotomous dependent variable allows us to determine which variables contribute to the "critical mass" condition precipitating private bill veto employment.

Here, the results are somewhat mixed. Four of nine variables are consistent with expected direction of influence; three of nine are statistically significant. The public bill veto variable affects private bill veto probability in a

major way (.001 level). The impact statistic, indicating the independent influence of each factor, shows that the public bill veto factor has the second-largest effect of all of the variables in the PIE model (.57). Thus, the relationship confirms a link between public and private bill veto behavior despite the distinct content of legislation. A plethora of public bill vetoes, connoting a lack of support for the chief executive, increases the likelihood of resorting to another form of the veto.

While the military background factor is significant at the .05 level and possesses the largest independent impact of any of the variables in the model (.58), its positive influence on private bill veto propensity was unexpected. Perhaps a chief executive with such background is apprehensive of pension claims and legislative intervention in military matters, albeit affecting individuals. The president may also be reacting to other types of private bills, such as claims or immigration legislation, and not simply those dealing with military issues. As hypothesized, the existence of a war is a condition lessening the likelihood of private bill veto employment. This variable is significant at the .10 level and has the third-largest independent impact of the variables in the model.

Of the remaining variables in the PIE model, the cabinet change and business failure rate indicators are in the expected direction of influence. On the other hand, the term party control, election, and private law measures are contrary to the hypothesized direction; none of these factors are significantly related to presidential private bill veto propensity. The overall PIE model is significant at the .001 level. The pseudo R² of .31 means about a third of private bill veto propensity is explained by the variables in the model. Seventy-eight of 100 cases, or 78 percent, were correctly predicted. Because the mean of the dependent variable is .69, the PIE model increases the predictive accuracy of nine decisions. On a per-president basis, the model perfectly predicts private bill veto likelihood during the first Grover Cleveland administration (4-4), Franklin Roosevelt's tenure (12-12), the Eisenhower presidency (8-8), and during the John

Kennedy years (3-3). The model correctly predicts 50 percent of actions or above for seventeen of eighteen chief executives in the analysis, falling below that figure for only the term of Chester Arthur (0-4).

Table 5 presents the results from the poisson regression procedure, which is used to assess annual count of private bill vetoes. Generally, the analysis confirms that the variables comprising the PIE model perform better in explaining private bill veto frequency than initial likelihood. Eight of nine variables are consistent with the expected direction of influence; only the war measure contradicts the hypothesis about its impact. It could be that a war heightens tensions between the executive and legislative branches of government, thus leading to more disagreement on the merits of private bills sent to the president. The presence of a major military conflict has been found to significantly affect likelihood of override of public bill vetoes at both stages of congressional reconsideration (Hoff 1992).

All nine variables in the model are statistically significant at the .001 level. The public bill veto, election, and number of private law indicators each have a positive influence on frequency of private bill vetoes released per year, whereas the military background, term, party control, business failure rate, and cabinet change measures each inversely affect private bill veto frequency annually. The passage of time itself has little if any influence on latter veto usage. For instance, a bivariate regression analysis between time and likelihood of private bill veto reveals a r^2 of .02 and a correlation coefficient of .19; a similar analysis between time and annual private bill veto count produces an r^2 of -.0007 and a correlation coefficient of -.05.

In the poisson analysis of annual private bill veto count, the entire PIE model is statistically significant at the .001 level. Together, the variables in the model explain almost one-half of yearly private bill veto employment over the century between 1869-1969. If we include only those sixty-nine years when any private bill vetoes were issued, we achieve analogous results in terms of

direction and significance of variables and R2 of the model to that of the full century time frame. If we control for the Grover Cleveland and Franklin Roosevelt administrations in the poisson analysis--leaving eighty cases--seven of nine variables are still significant at the .10 level or lower; five of nine variables impact private bill veto frequency in the expected direction; the entire PIE model is still significant at the .001 level; and the R2 is not much lower (.42) than with all years and all presidents included in the study (.48).

Discussion

Even though the PIE model of private bill veto behavior performed better in predicting veto frequency than initial likelihood, the value of the model for investigating the topic is without doubt. It is interesting to note that, of the three factors which were significant in both analyses, one (military background) is a personal component of the model, another (public bill veto frequency) is an institutional part of the model, and a third (war) is an environmental section of the model. Thus, all segments of the PIE model have relevance for explaining actions by chief executives with this type of presidential veto.

We may draw several conclusions from this research. First, decisions pertaining to private bill vetoes are conscious and intentional, not automatic. Presidents, cabinet secretaries, and bureaucratic personnel clearly invest a large amount of time in researching the content and merits of private bills. In the rare instances when the president's negation of a private bill is successfully challenged, Congress too evaluates evidence carefully. In the three cases where Ulysses Grant had such vetoes overridden, the average delay between initial issuance of the veto and second chamber vote was over a month; in the three cases of overrides of second-term private bill vetoes by Grover Cleveland, the average span between veto and final stage vote was over two hundred days; and in the case of the override of a private bill veto by Harry Truman, the duration between veto and final reconsideration was almost five months.

A second observation about the veto process involving private bills is the human element present. Because many private bill vetoes occurred before the era of social security and job-based savings plans, the outcome of a private bill claim often meant the difference between a comfortable retirement and abject, humiliating poverty. The following declassified memorandum written by Nixon advisor John Ehrlichman on December 18, 1970 offers a stark illustration of the ramifications of private bill veto actions:

A redraft of the proposed veto statement on H.R. 2335 is attached. However, I strongly feel that the President should not veto this bill. Doing so could have serious political repercussions. The President should not be put in the position of thwarting a Congressional effort to grant a relatively small amount of relief to a man who has been blind for 42 years and whose wife, who had been supporting him, was killed in a automobile accident. This would leave the President wide open to charges that he is a cold, heartless man, and I'm sure someone would use the veto--done just before Christmas—to support that charge. If there is a dangerous precedent involved—and I doubt that there is—then the basic responsibility lies with the Congress which passed the special bill. We should not cast the President in the role of Scrooge on December 23.

As a matter of record, President Nixon followed Ehrlichman's suggestion. H.R. 2335 was signed into law a short time thereafter.

Finally, the institutional legacy of private bill vetoes is somewhat dubious. Returning to Jackson's (1967) win-win depiction of private bills for the chief executive and Congress, the tool's use certainly augmented the electoral fortunes of both, even if vetoes of such legislation ceded more authority to the former. However, the amount of time spent on private bill matters was enormous, perhaps even wasteful from a national perspective. There is certainly an analogy

between that assertion and contemporary criticism of commemorative-type joint resolutions. Still, one should not ignore the precedents which successful private laws created in the areas of military policy and immigration. It is hoped that with preliminary studies like the present one, “the contemporary lack of interest and concern about private bills could change...” (Spitzer 1987: 83). As they pertain to the veto process, private bills furnish fascinating insights and a treasure-trove of data for future inquiries.

Table 1
Variables and Assumptions of the PIE Model of Presidential Private Bill Vetoes

I. Personal Factors

Variable 1: president's military background (0 for no, 1 for yes). This variable is expected to reduce probability and number of private bill vetoes, as the president hits likely affinity with veterans if he is one himself

Variable 2: term which the president is serving (0 for first, 1 for second or third term). As opposed to the pattern with public bill vetoes, presidents are assumed to veto more private bills by regular means in their first term, thereby dissuading Congress from sending future bills without merit.

II. Institutional Factors

Variable 3: annual number of private laws. This is the number of private laws passed per Congress, divided by 2. The hypothesis here is that a large number of private laws will increase frequency of unjustified claims or requests, thus leading to more vetoes of private bills.

Variable 4: party control of Congress. This variable is operationalized as percent of members of the House and Senate sharing the president's party affiliation, divided by 2. Having a party majority in Congress should reduce the probability and number of private bill vetoes, since the president will want to retain friendly relations and retain his bargaining power with public bills.

Variable 5: annual regular public bill vetoes, as counted. Though the content of public and private bills differs, the former should have an impact on the latter. That is, a disagreement between the president and Congress on matters of public policy should carry over to private bills. An increase in public bill vetoes should augment probability and number of private bill vetoes.

III. Environmental Factors

Variable 6: business failure rate, as measured per 10,000 listed enterprises. This variable furnishes an indication of economic activity over the century span of the analysis. It is hypothesized to have an inverse relationship with private bill vetoes. As the business failure rate increases, presidents will be less prone to veto bills involving individuals seeking assistance from the government.

Variable 7: cabinet change. This variable measures change in secretaries of the Departments of Defense and State made annually by American presidents. Because the latter secretaries are most involved in making determinations of the merits of private bills, instability created by rapid turnover of these personnel should lessen presidential proclivity to issue private bill vetoes.

Variable 8: war (0 for no, 1 for yes). During the 1869-1969 time frame, the United States participated in the following major conflicts: Spanish-American War, World War I, World War II, Korean War, Vietnam War. While other factors may promote disagreement during war, presidents would not be likely to veto many private bills during international conflicts, particularly when a large number of such bills pertain to requests for military pensions or changes in military rank or status. Hence, the condition of war should reduce propensity for private bill vetoes.

Variable 9: election (0 for no, 1 for yes). This variable is operationalized as a Federal election occurring every other year, such as a congressional election or a presidential contest. Vetoes issued during election years have the effect of sending a message to Congress that the president means business. Elections highlight the divergent constituencies of the president and members of Congress. Because the legislature tends to defer to the president on private bills, vetoing such bills will be politically beneficial in most cases. Probability and frequency of regular private bill vetoes should increase during the election season every two years.

IV. Dependent Variables

Probit analysis: probability of a regular private bill veto being issued annually (0 for no, 1 for yes). Poisson regression analysis: number of regular private bill vetoes issued per year, as counted.

Table 2
Private Bill Vetoes by President, 1869-1969*

<i>President</i>	<i>Total</i>	<i>Ave./Year</i>
U. Grant	24	4.00
R. Hayes	1	.25
C. Arthur	1	.25
G. Cleveland I	270	67.50
B. Harrison	4	1.00
G. Cleveland II	25	6.25
W. McKinley	4	1.00
T. Roosevelt	22	2.75
W. Taft	7	1.75
W. Wilson	5	.63
W. Harding	0	.00
C. Coolidge	3	.50
H. Hoover	3	.75
F. Roosevelt	187	15.83
H. Truman	84	10.50
D. Eisenhower	27	3.38
J. Kennedy	8	2.67
L. Johnson	5	1.00

N=680 Ave=6.80

* Refers to regular private bill vetoes of individual-based legislation.

Table 3
Years Without Private Bill Vetoes, 1869-1969*

1. 1869-Grant
2. 1877-Hayes
3. 1878-Hayes
4. 1880-Hayes
5. 1881-Arthur
6. 1882-Arthur
7. 1883-Arthur
8. 1885-Cleveland I
9. 1889-B. Harrison
10. 1893-Cleveland II
11. 1897-McKinley
12. 1901-T. Roosevelt
13. 1904-T. Roosevelt
14. 1905-T. Roosevelt
15. 1909-Taft
16. 1915-Wilson
17. 1916-Wilson
18. 1917-Wilson
19. 1918-Wilson
20. 1921-Harding
21. 1922-Harding
22. 1923-Coolidge
23. 1924-Coolidge
24. 1925-Coolidge
25. 1927-Coolidge
26. 1929-Hoover
27. 1930-Hoover
28. 1933-F. Roosevelt
29. 1952-Truman
30. 1967-L. Johnson
31. 1968-L. Johnson

* Refers to regular private bill vetoes of individual-based legislation.

Table 4
Probit Analysis of PIE Model of Private Bill Vetoes, 1869-1969

<u>Variable</u>	<u>MLE</u>	<u>SE</u>	<u>T-Value</u>	<u>Impact</u>	<u>Mean</u>
constant	.02	1.48	.01		
military	.77	.38	2.03*	.58	.56
term	.16	.47	.33	.08	.24
private laws	-.0002	.0004	-.63	.004	390.48
party control	.008	.019	.41	.06	56.56
public bill vetoes	.29	.09	3.24**	.57	3.90
business fail rate	-.010	.007	-1.42	.09	80.38
cabinet change	-.15	.25	-.62	.10	.42
war	-.89	.54	-1.63***	.36	.16
election	-.09	.34	-.26	.06	.50

N=100

Pseudo R2=.31

Chi2 (9)=38.11**

Mean of Private Bill Veto Propensity=.69/Percent Correctly Predicted=.78

* Significant at .05 level.

** Significant at .001 level.

*** Significant at .10 level.

Table 5
Poisson Regression Analysis of PIE Model of Private Bill Vetoes, 1869-1969

<u>Variable</u>	<u>Coefficient</u>	<u>SE</u>	<u>T-Value</u>	<u>Effect</u>
constant	4.23	.35	12.14*	
military	-1.44	.12	-12.01*	9.79
term	-1.11	.14	-7.92*	7.55
private laws	.0006	.0001	7.80*	.004
party control	-.033	.005	-6.62*	.22
public bill vetoes	.123	.007	18.51*	.84
business fail rate	-.012	.002	-7.39*	.08
cabinet change	-.33	.08	-3.86*	2.24
war	.61	.16	3.93*	4.15
election	.41	.11	3.89*	2.79

N=100

Mean of Annual Private Bill Veto Count=6.8

Highest Intercorrelation=business fail rate (.32)

Pseudo R2=.48

Chi2 (9)=1024.57*

* Significant at .001 level.

Appendix
List of Private Bill Vetoes in PIE Model, 1869-1969

Ulysses S. Grant

1. S. 273, January 11, 1870, for the relief of Rollin White.
2. H.R. 1395, January 4, 1871, for the relief of Charles Cooper, Goshorn A. Jones, Jerome Rowley, William Hannegan and John Hannegan.
3. H.R. 2566, February 28, 1871, for the relief of Henry Willman, late a private in the Third Regiment Indian Cavalry.
4. S. 105, June 1, 1872, for the relief of Dr. J. Milton Best.
5. S. 569, June 7, 1872, for the relief of Thomas B. Wallace, of Lexington, in the State of Missouri.
6. S. 805, April 15, 1872, granting a pension to Abigail Ryan, widow of Thomas A. Ryan.
7. S. 955, May 14, 1872, granting a pension to Mary Ann Montgomery, widow of William W. Montgomery, late captain in the Texas volunteers, *overridden*.
8. H.R. 622, April 22, 1872, granting a pension to Richard B. Crawford.
9. H.R. 1550, March 28, 1872, for the relief of the estate of Dr. John F. Hanks.
10. H.R. 1867, April 1, 1872, for the relief of James T. Johnson.
11. H.R. 2041, April 10, 1872, for the relief of the children of John M. Baker, deceased.
12. H.R. 2291, January 6, 1873, for the relief of Edmund Jussen.
13. H.R. 2852, February 8, 1873, for the relief of James A. McCullah, late collector of the fifth district of Missouri.
14. H.R. 1224, April 10, 1874, for the relief of William H. Denniston, late an acting second lieutenant, Seventieth New York volunteers.
15. H.R. 1331, May 12, 1874, for the relief of Joab Spencer and James R. Mead, for supplies furnished the Kansas tribe of Indians.
16. H.R. 2352, February 12, 1875, granting a pension to Lewis Hinely.
17. H.R. 4462, January 30, 1875, for the relief of Alexander Burtch.
18. S. 165, June 9, 1876, for the relief of Michael W. Brock, of Megis County Tennessee, late a private in Company D, Tenth Tennessee Volunteers.
19. S. 489, March 31, 1876, for the relief of G. B. Tyler and E. H. Lockett, assignees of William T. Cheatham, *overridden*.
20. S. 561, August 15, 1876, for the relief of Major Junius T. Turner.
21. H.R. 11, July 13, 1876, to provide a pension to Eliza Jane Blumer.
22. H.R. 83, March 27, 1876, to provide for the relief of James A. Hile, of Lewis County, Missouri.
23. H.R. 1337, July 11, 1876, to provide for the relief of Nelson Tiffany, *overridden*.

24. S. 691, February 28, 1877, to provide for the relief of Edward A. Leland.

Rutherford B. Hayes

1. S. 595, June 27, 1879, to amend an act for the relief of Joseph B. Collins, approved March 3, 1879.

Chester A. Arthur

1. H.R. 1015, July 2, 1884, to provide for the relief of Fitz-John Porter.

Grover Cleveland

1. S. 183, June 19, 1886, for the relief of Thomas S. Hopkins, late of Company C, Sixteenth Maine Volunteers.

2. S. 193, March 10, 1886, for the relief of John Hollins McBlair.

3. S. 226, June 19, 1886, granting a pension to Mrs. Margaret D. Marchand.

4. S. 327, June 2, 1886, granting a pension to James E. O'Shea.

5. S. 342, June 22, 1886, granting a pension to Mavilla Parsons, of Detroit, Michigan.

6. S. 363, May 24, 1886, granting a pension to Edward Ayres.

7. S. 365, July 3, 1886, granting a pension to Martin L. Bundy.

8. S. 789, June 2, 1886, granting a pension to John S. Williams.

9. S. 857, May 24, 1886, granting a pension to Dudley B. Branch.

10. S. 1077, June 29, 1886, granting a pension to Newcomb Parker.

11. S. 1192, June 22, 1886, granting a pension to Alfred Denny.

12. S. 1253, May 28, 1886, granting a pension to J.D. Haworth.

13. S. 1288, June 22, 1886, granting a pension to Robert Holsey.

14. S. 1290, May 25, 1886, granting a pension to David W. Hamilton.

15. S. 1383, June 22, 1886, granting a pension to Harriet Welch.

16. S. 1400, June 22, 1886, granting a pension to William H. Beck.

17. S. 1421, July 31, 1886, granting a pension to William H. Weaver.

18. S. 1441, June 1, 1886, granting a pension to M. Romahr.

19. S. 1584, June 21, 1886, for the relief of Cornelia R. Schenck.

20. S. 1630, May 24, 1886, granting a pension to James C. Chandler.

21. S. 1726, June 2, 1886, granting a pension to Augustus Field Stevens.

22. S. 1797, June 29, 1886, granting a pension to John S. Kirkpatrick.

23. S. 1850, May 21, 1886, granting a pension to Mrs. Annie C. Owen.

24. S. 1998, May 25, 1886, granting a pension to John D. Ham.

25. S. 2005, June 22, 1886, granting a pension to Mary J. Nottage.

26. S. 2025, June 22, 1886, granting a pension to James Butler.

27. S. 2160, July 31, 1886, granting a pension to Mary J. Hageman.

28. S. 2186, May 24, 1886, granting a pension to Louis Melcher.

29. S. 2223, June 21, 1886, granting a pension to Elizabeth S. De Krafft.
30. H.R. 424, June 23, 1886, to amend the military record of Giles C. Hawley, and to place his name on the pension-roll.
31. H.R. 473, July 2, 1886, granting a pension to William Boone.
32. H.R. 524, July 9, 1886, granting a pension to Daniel H. Ross.
33. H.R. 576, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Louisa C. Beezeley.
34. H.R. 1059, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to Joseph Romiser.
35. H.R. 1406, May 28, 1886, granting a pension to Simmons W. Harden.
36. H.R. 1471, May 8, 1886, granting a pension to Andrew J. Hill.
37. H.R. 1505, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to William Dermody.
38. H.R. 1582, May 28, 1886, for the relief of Eleanor C. Bangham.
39. H.R. 1584, August 4, 1886, for the relief of Mrs. Aurelia C. Richardson.
40. H.R. 1707, June 21, 1886, granting a pension to Elijah P. Hensley.
41. H.R. 1816, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Mary Ann Miller.
42. H.R. 1818, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to H.L. Kyler.
43. H.R. 1990, June 19, 1886, granting a pension to John Hunter.
44. H.R. 2043, July 6, 1886, to place Mary Karstetter on the pension-roll.
45. H.R. 2145, May 28, 1886, for the relief of Rebecca Eldridge.
46. H.R. 2971, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to Francis Deming.
47. H.R. 3019, May 8, 1886, to increase the pension to Abigail Smith.
48. H.R. 3043, July 6, 1886, granting a pension to Lewis W. Scanland.
49. H.R. 3205, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to George W. Guyse.
50. H.R. 3304, July 5, 1886, to restore the name of Abner Morehead on the pension-roll.
51. H.R. 3363, July 31, 1886, granting a pension to Jennette Dow.
52. H.R. 3551, August 4, 1886, granting a pension to George W. Cutler, late a private in
Company B, Ninth New Hampshire Volunteers.
53. H.R. 3623, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to William H. Nevil.
54. H.R. 3624, June 21, 1886, granting a pension to Fred J. Leese.
55. H.R. 3640, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to James T. Irwin.
56. H.R. 3826, June 19, 1886, for the relief of John Taylor.
57. H.R. 4002, June 19, 1886, granting a pension to Carter W. Tiller.
58. H.R. 4058, June 19, 1886, for the relief of Joel D. Monroe.
59. H.R. 4426, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to Fannie E. Evans.
60. H.R. 4642, July 6, 1886, granting a pension to James Carroll.
61. H.R. 4782, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to Elizabeth McKay.
62. H.R. 4797, July 6, 1886, granting a pension to Robert H. Stapleton.
63. H.R. 5021, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to Mrs. Margaret A. Jacoby.
64. H.R. 5306, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to Roxana V. Rowley and son.
65. H.R. 5389, August 4, 1886, granting a pension to Ann Kinney.
66. H.R. 5394, July 6, 1886, granting a pension to Sally Ann Bradley.
67. H.R. 5414, July 6, 1886, granting a pension to Maria Cunningham.

68. H.R. 5603, July 6, 1886, granting a pension to Mrs. Catherine McCarty.
69. H.R. 5995, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to David T. Elderkin.
70. H.R. 5997, June 19, 1886, granting a pension to Elizabeth Luce.
71. H.R. 6177, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to James D. Cotton.
72. H.R. 6136, June 21, 1886, granting a pension to John W. Farris.
73. H.R. 6170, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Mrs. Mary A. Van Etten.
74. H.R. 6192, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Mary Norman.
75. H.R. 6257, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Julia Connelly.
76. H.R. 6266, Jun 23, 1886, granting a pension to Philip Arner.
77. H.R. 6372, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Charles A. Chase.
78. H.R. 6648, July 6, 1886, for the relief of Edward M. Harrington.
79. H.R. 6688, June 3, 1886, granting a pension to William Bishop.
80. H.R. 6718, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to William H. Starr.
81. H.R. 6753, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Mrs. Alice E. Travers.
82. H.R. 6774, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Bruno Schultz.
83. H.R. 6895, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Sarah Harbaugh.
84. H.R. 6897, June 21, 1886, granting a pension to Henry Hipple, Jr.
85. H.R. 7018, July 5, 1886, granting a pension to Aretus F. Loomis.
86. H.R. 7073, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Mary S. Woodson.
87. H.R. 7108, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Andrew J. Wilson.
88. H.R. 7109, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Joseph Tuttle.
89. H.R. 7162, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Martha McIlwain.
90. H.R. 7167, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Maria Hunter.
91. H.R. 7222, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Callie West.
92. H.R. 7234, August 4, 1886, granting a pension to Susan Hawes.
93. H.R. 7257, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to James H. Darling.
94. H.R. 7298, June 23, 1886, for the relief of Charles Schuler.
95. H.R. 7401, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Samuel Miller.
96. H.R. 7436, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Mary Anderson.
97. H.R. 7614, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Hezekiah Tillman.
98. H.R. 7703, June 23, 1886, granting a pension to Anna A. Probert.
99. H.R. 7931, June 23, 1886, increasing the pension to Clark Boon.
100. H.R. 7979, June 22, 1886, granting a pension to Jackson Steward.
101. H.R. 8336, July 31, 1886, granting a pension to Duncan Forbes.
102. H.R. 8556, August 4, 1886, granting a pension to Abraham Points.
103. H.R. 9106, July 31, 1886, granting a pension to Rachel Barns.
104. S. 127, January 27, 1887, for the relief of H.K. Belding.
105. S. 859, February 19, 1887, granting a pension to Charlotte O'Neal.
106. S. 1626, February 19, 1887, granting a pension to John Reed, Sr.
107. S. 1768, February 21, 1887, granting a pension to John D. Fincher.
108. S. 2045, February 26, 1887, granting pension to Mrs. Sarah Hamilton.
109. S. 2111, February 21, 1887, granting a pension to Jacob Smith.
110. S. 2167, January 31, 1887, granting a pension to Margaret Dunlap.

111. S 2173, January 27, 1887, granting a pension to Benjamin Obekiah.
112. S. 2210, February 26, 1887, granting a pension to Anna Wright.
113. S. 2269, January 19, 1887, granting a pension to William Dickens.
114. S. 2452, February 21, 1887, granting a pension to Rachel Ann Pierpont.
115. H.R. 927, February 4, 1887, granting a pension to Cudberth Stone.
116. H.R. 5877, February 23, 1887, for the relief of William H. Morhiser.
117. H.R. 6132, February 3, 1887, granting a pension to William Lynch.
118. H.R. 6443, February 3, 1887, granting a pension to Alexander Falconer.
119. H.R. 6825, February 4, 1887, granting a pension to J.R. Baylor.
120. H.R. 6832, February 4, 1887, granting a pension to Mrs. Catherine Sattler.
121. H.R. 7327, February 23, 1887, granting a pension to Anthony McRobertson.
122. H.R. 7540, February 4, 1887, to increase the pension to Franklin Sweet.
123. H.R. 7648, February 24, 1887, for the relief of the estate of John How, Indian agent, and his sureties.
124. H.R. 7698, February 4, 1887, granting a pension to Robert K. Bennett.
125. H.R. 8002, February 23, 1887, to increase the pension to Loren Burritt.
126. H.R. 8150, February 4, 1887, granting a pension to Jesse Campbell.
127. H.R. 8834, February 4, 1887, granting a pension to Abraham P. Griggs.
128. H.R. 10082, February 23, 1887, to increase the pension of Margaret R. Jones.
129. S. 43, July 5, 1888, granting a pension to Polly H. Smith.
130. S. 121, July 16, 1888, granting a pension to Tobias Baney.
131. S. 258, April 18, 1888, for the relief of Major Daniel N. Bash, paymaster, United States Army.
132. S. 432, July 5, 1888, for the relief of Joel B. Morton.
133. S. 465, April 30, 1888, granting a pension to William Sackman, Sr.
134. S. 470, July 16, 1888, granting a pension to Amanda F. Deck.
135. S. 549, April 16, 1888, granting a pension to Hannah R. Langdon.
136. S. 645, August 22, 1888, granting a pension to Mrs. Margaret B. Todd.
137. S. 739, June 5, 1888, granting a pension to Johanna Loewinger.
138. S. 809, April 16, 1888, granting a pension to Betsey Mansfield.
139. S. 820, May 28, 1888, granting a pension to David A. Servis.
140. S. 835, May 28, 1888, for the relief of Elisha Griswold.
141. S. 838, April 30, 1888, granting a pension to Mary Sullivan.
142. S. 845, June 26, 1888, granting a pension to the widow of John A. Turley.
143. S. 1017, June 12, 1888, granting a pension to Stephen Schiedel.
144. S. 1064, May 18, 1888, for the relief of L.J. Worden.
145. S. 1076, August 14, 1888, granting a pension to the widow of John Leary, deceased.
146. S. 1237, May 28, 1888, granting a pension to Anna Mertz.
147. S. 1447, July 26, 1888, granting a pension to Bridget Foley.
148. S. 1542, August 22, 1888, granting a pension to John W. Reynolds.
149. S. 1547, July 5, 1888, granting a pension to Mary Ann Dougherty.
150. S. 1613, July 17, 1888, granting an increase of pension to John F. Ballier.

151. S. 1762, August 14, 1888, granting a pension to Benjamin A. Burtram.
152. S. 1772, June 12, 1888, for the relief of John H. Marion.
153. S. 1957, June 19, 1888, granting a pension to Virtue Smith.
154. S. 2201, October 10, 1888, for the relief of Laura E. Maddox, widow and executrix, and Robert Morrison, executor of Joseph H. Maddox, deceased.
155. S. 2206, August 22, 1888, granting a pension to David H. Lutman.
156. S. 2370, August 22, 1888, granting a pension to Sarah C. Anderson and children under sixteen years of age.
157. S. 2616, August 22, 1888, granting a pension to James E. Kabler.
158. S. 2653, August 14, 1888, granting a pension to Mary Curtin.
159. S. 3038, August 22, 1888, for the relief of P.E. Parker.
160. S. 3208, October 15, 1888, granting a pension to William S. Bradshaw.
161. S. 3276, October 12, 1888, granting a restoration of pension to Sarah A. Woodbridge.
162. S. 3306, October 15, 1888, granting a pension to Mary K. Richards.
163. H.R. 19, May 1, 1888, for the relief of H.B. Wilson, administrator of the estate of William Tinder, deceased.
164. H.R. 88, May 19, 1888, granting a pension to Sally A. Randall.
165. H.R. 149, August 10, 1888, granting a pension to Rachel Barnes.
166. H.R. 217, September 7, 1888, granting a pension to C.T. Maphet.
167. H.R. 333, September 7, 1888, granting a pension to Catherine Busey.
168. H.R. 339, May 26, 1888, for the relief of J.E. Pilcher.
169. H.R. 367, July 6, 1888, granting a pension to Nathaniel D. Chase.
170. H.R. 418, April 21, 1888, granting a pension to William H. Brokenshaw.
171. H.R. 445, April 16, 1888, granting a pension to Laura A. Wright.
172. H.R. 488, June 19, 1888, granting a pension to Elizabeth Burr.
173. H.R. 490, August 10, 1888, granting a pension to George W. Pitner.
174. H.R. 600, June 22, 1888, increasing the pension of Mary Minor Hoxey.
175. H.R. 823, April 21, 1888, granting a pension to Hanna C. DeWitt.
176. H.R. 879, May 19, 1888, granting a pension to Royal J. Hiar.
177. H.R. 2088, August 22, 1888, for the relief of W. S. Carpenter.
178. H.R. 2140, August 9, 1888, granting a pension to Eliza Smith.
179. H.R. 2215, June 22, 1888, granting a pension to Charles Glamann.
180. H.R. 2233, August 10, 1888, granting a pension to Bernard Carlin.
181. H.R. 2282, May 18, 1888, granting a pension to Mrs. Theodora M. Piatt.
182. H.R. 2472, October 17, 1888, granting a pension to Lydia A. Eaton.
183. H.R. 2477, April 4, 1888, for the relief of Nathaniel McKay and the executors of Donald McKay.
184. H.R. 2507, September 6, 1888, granting a pension to Russell L. Doane, of Peck, Saniilac County, Michigan.
185. H.R. 2524, August 27, 1888, for the relief of Clement A. Lounsberry.
186. H.R. 3008, August 3, 1888, for the relief of P.A. Leatherbury.
187. H.R. 3016, June 22, 1888, granting a pension to Mary F. Harkins.

188. H.R. 3521, August 9, 1888, granting a pension to Manuel Garcia.
189. H.R. 3579, May 19, 1888, granting a pension to Ellen Shea.
190. H.R. 3959, June 18, 1888, granting a pension to Dolly Blazer.
191. H.R. 4102, October 17, 1888, granting a pension to Mary A. Carr.
192. H.R. 4535, May 3, 1888, for the relief of Emily G. Mills.
193. H.R. 4550, April 24, 1888, granting a pension to Chloe Quiggle, widow of Phillip Quiggle.
194. H.R. 4580, May 19, 1888, granting a pension to Farnaren Ball.
195. H.R. 4633, April 21, 1888, granting a pension to Morris T. Mantor.
196. H.R. 4820, October 17, 1888, granting a pension to Ellen Kelly.
197. H.R. 4855, September 7, 1888, granting a pension to Jacob Newhard.
198. H.R. 5155, September 1, 1888, granting a pension to John S Bryant.
199. H.R. 5234, May 19, 1888, granting a pension to Cyrenius G. Stryker.
200. H.R. 5247, April 24, 1888, granting a pension to William H. Brimmer.
201. H.R. 5503, September 7, 1888, granting a pension to Charles Walster.
202. H.R. 5522, June 18, 1888, for the relief of Elijah Martin.
203. H.R. 5525, September 7, 1888, granting a pension to Mrs. Jane Potts.
204. H.R. 5545, May 18, 1888, granting a pension to Nancy F. Jennings.
205. H.R. 5913, July 17, 1888, granting a pension to Thomas Shannon.
206. H.R. 6193, August 10, 1888, for the relief of Edson Saxberry.
207. H.R. 6201, October 16, 1888, granting a pension to John Robeson.
208. H.R. 6307, August 9, 1888, granting a pension to Sarah A. Corson.
209. H.R. 6371, September 13, 1888, granting a pension to Jesse M. Stilwell.
210. H.R. 6431, July 6, 1888, for the relief of Van Buren Brown.
211. H.R. 6609, May 19, 1888, for the relief of Sarah E. McCaleb.
212. H.R. 6908, April 24, 1888, granting a pension to William P. Witt.
213. H.R. 7510, August 9, 1888, granting a pension to Stephen A. Seavey.
214. H.R. 7657, October 16, 1888, granting a pension to Mary Woodworth, widow of Ebenezer F Woodworth.
215. H.R. 7715, May 10, 1888, for the relief of Georgia A. Stricklett.
216. H.R. 7717, September 7, 1888, granting a pension to Mrs. Catherine Reed.
217. H.R. 7907, July 5, 1888, granting a pension to Mary Ann Lang.
218. H.R. 8078, July 17, 1888, granting a pension to Theresa Herbst, widow of John Herbst, late private Company G, 140th Regiment of New York Volunteers.
219. H.R. 8164, May 19, 1888, granting a pension to William H. Hester.
220. H.R. 8174, June 22, 1888, granting a pension to Ellen Sexton.
221. H.R. 8281, June 22, 1888, for the relief of Lieutenant James G.W. Hardy.
222. H.R. 8291, July 5, 1888, granting a pension to Julia Welch.
223. H.R. 8574, August 10, 1888, granting a pension to Sallie T. Ward, widow of the late W.T. Ward.
224. H.R. 8761, August 9, 1888, granting a pension to Mrs. Anna Butterfield.
225. H.R. 8807, July 6, 1888, granting a pension to Harriet E. Cooper.
226. H.R. 9034, August 10, 1888, granting a pension to Lydia A. Heiny.

227. H.R. 9106, October 16, 1888, granting a pension to Peter Liner.
228. H.R. 9126, August 10, 1888, granting a pension to Mrs. Caroline G. Seyfforth.
229. H.R. 9174, July 17, 1888, granting a pension to Woodford M. Houchin.
230. H.R. 9183, August 10, 1888, granting a pension to William P. Riddle.
231. H.R. 9184, July 6, 1888, granting a pension to William M. Campbell.
232. H.R. 9344, August 10, 1888, granting a pension to James C. White.
233. H.R. 9363, September 1, 1888, granting a pension to Edwin J. Godfrey.
234. H.R. 9372, September 7, 1888, granting a pension to John Dean.
235. H.R. 9520, July 16, 1888, for the relief of Mary Fitzmorris.
236. H.R. 10342, October 17, 1888, granting a pension to John Dauper.
237. H.R. 10504, October 17, 1888, granting a pension to Mary Hooper.
238. H.R. 10563, October 16, 1888, granting a pension to William S. Latham.
239. H.R. 10661, October 16, 1888, granting a pension to Mrs. Sophia Vogelsang.
240. H.R. 11005, October 17, 1888, granting a pension to Ester Gaven.
241. H.R. 11222, October 17, 1888, granting a pension to Elizabeth Heckler.
242. H.R. 11332, October 17, 1888, granting a pension to Eliza S. Glass.
243. S. 2514, February 13, 1889, granting a pension to Michael Shong.
244. S. 2665, February 14, 1889, granting a pension to Charles J. Esty.
245. S. 3264, January 31, 1889, granting a pension to Mrs. Ellen Hand.
246. S. 3451, February 13, 1889, granting a pension to Frank D. Worcester.
247. S. 3561, February 25, 1889, granting a pension to Edwin W. Warner.
248. S. 3646, January 17, 1889, for the relief of William R. Wheaton and Charles H. Chamberlain, of California.
249. H.R. 7, January 16, 1889, granting a pension to Thomas B. Walsh.
250. H.R. 220, February 23, 1889, granting a pension to John J. Lockrey.
251. H.R. 2236, January 16, 1889, granting a pension to Eli J. Yamgheim.
252. H.R. 4887, January 16, 1889, granting a pension to Charles E. Scott.
253. H.R. 5080, December 19, 1888, for the relief of C.B. Wilson.
254. H.R. 5752, February 12, 1889, for the relief of Julia Triggs.
255. H.R. 5807, February 23, 1889, granting a pension to John McCool.
256. H.R. 7877, January 18, 1889, to place Mary Karstetter on the pension-roll.
257. H.R. 8469, January 16, 1889, for the relief of Michael Pigott.
258. H.R. 9163, February 12, 1889, granting a pension to Eli Garret.
259. H.R. 9173, January 18, 1889, granting a pension to Mary I. Drake.
260. H.R. 9175, January 18, 1889, granting a pension to George Walden.
261. H.R. 9252, January 18, 1889, granting a pension to Mrs. Catherine Baberick, of Watertown.
262. H.R. 9296, January 18, 1889, granting a pension to Bridget Carroll.
263. H.R. 10448, February 25, 1889, granting a pension to Squire Walter.
264. H.R. 10791, February 26, 1889, granting a pension to Marina Wakefield Reed.
265. H.R. 11052, February 12, 1889, granting a pension to Clara M. Owen.
266. H.R. 11466, February 26, 1889, granting a pension to Mary A. Selbach.
267. H.R. 11586, February 26, 1889, for the relief of Stephen Williams.

268. H.R. 11803, February 23, 1889, granting a pension to Henry V. Bass.
269. H.R. 11999, February 23, 1889, granting a pension to William Barnes.
270. H.R. 12047, February 26, 1889, granting pension increase to George Colwell.

Benjamin Harrison

1. S. 1857, October 1, 1890, for the relief of Charles P. Chouteau, survivor of Chouteau, Harrison & Valle.
2. H.J. Res. 39, September 30, 1890, declaring the retirement of Captain Charles B. Stivers, of the United States Army, valid, and that he be entitled as much retired officer to his pay.
3. S. 3270, March 2, 1891, for the relief of the administratrix of the estate of George W. Lawrence.
4. S. 1958, July 29, 1892, to submit to the Court of Claims the title of William McGarrahan to the Rancho Panoche Grande, in the State of California, and for other purposes.

Grover Cleveland

1. S. 1438, August 11, 1894, for the relief of Louis A. Yorke.
2. H.R. 2637, August 7, 1894, for the relief of Eugene Wells, late Captain Twelfth Infantry and Second Lieutenant First Artillery, United States Army.
3. S. 143, February 1895, for the relief of the heirs of D. Fulford.
4. S. 1526, February 20, 1895, for the relief of Henry Halteman.
5. H.R. 2051, February 27, 1895, to grant a pension to Eunice Putman.
6. H.R. 4658, February 23, 1895, granting pension to Hiram R. Rhea.
7. H.R. 5368, February 5, 1895, for the relief of H.W. McConnell.
8. H.R. 6244, February 19, 1895, to remove the charge of desertion from the military record of Jacob Eckert.
9. H.R. 6868, February 27, 1895, for the relief of Catherine Ott, widow of Joseph Ott.
10. S. 147, May 29, 1896, granting a pension to Elvira Bachelder.
11. S. 149, June 1, 1896, granting a pension to Helen M. Jacob.
12. S. 249, April 21, 1896, granting a pension to Charles E. Jones.
13. H.R. 577, May 20, 1896, granting a pension to Lydia A. Taft.
14. H.R. 900, May 29, 1896, to provide for the payment of the claim of William H. Mahoney.
15. H.R. 1094, April 25, 1896, granting a pension to Francis E. Hoover, *overridden*.
16. H.R. 1139, May 19, 1896, granting a pension to Caroline D. Mowatt, *overridden*.
17. H.R. 4526, May 30, 1896, granting a pension to Jonathan Scott.
18. H.R. 6037, May 30, 1896, granting a pension to Mrs. Amanda Woodcock.
19. H.R. 7161, May 26, 1896, for the relief of Benjamin F. Jones.

20. H.R. 1185, May 21, 1896, granting a pension to Rachel Patton, *overridden*.
21. S. 719, March 1, 1897, to restore a pension to Harriet M. Knowlton.
22. S. 1321, February 22, 1897, granting a pension to Maria Somerlat, widow of Valentine Somerlat.
23. H.R. 1299, March 1, 1897, granting a pension to Harriet Woodbury, of Windsor, Vermont.
24. H.R. 2189, February 22, 1897, granting a pension to Mrs. Mary A. Freeman.
25. H.R. 6902, February 22, 1897, granting a pension to Mrs. Mary A. Viel.

William McKinley

1. H.R. 2219, May 16, 1898, for the relief of the administrators of Isaac P. Tice, deceased, and others.
2. S. 708, January 18, 1899, for the relief of Albert E. Redstone.
3. H.R. 1454, May 16, 1900, for the relief of William L. Orr.
4. H.R. 321, March 2, 1901, for the relief of the legal representatives of Samuel Tewksbury.

Theodore Roosevelt

1. S. 24, March 15, 1902, for the relief of James W. Howell.
2. S. 336, March 15, 1902, to grant honorable discharge from the military service of Charles H. Hawley.
3. S. 1258, March 11, 1902, to remove the charge of desertion from naval record of John Glass.
4. H.R. 3309, June 23, 1902, to remove the charge of desertion against Ephraim H. Gallion.
5. H.R. 3762, March 28, 1902, for the relief of Emanuel Klauser.
6. H.R. 4446, May 15, 1902, for the relief of Harry C. Mix.
7. H.R. 5761, April 16, 1902, granting a pension to Thomas F. Walker.
8. S. 1115, February 21, 1903, for the relief of Francis S. Davidson, late First Lieutenant, Ninth United States Cavalry.
9. S. 1168, March 3, 1903, authorizing the appointment of Edward L. Bailey, as captain of infantry, United States Army and to place him on the retired list.
10. S. 4308, February 11, 1903, for the relief of Katie A. Nolan.
11. H.R. 10095, February 25, 1903, for the relief of Levi L. Reed.
12. S. 3454, May 16, 1906, granting an increase of pension to William Wilson.
13. S. 2578, February 4, 1907, for the relief of Alice Stafford, administratrix of the estate of Captain Stephen R. Stafford.
14. S. 5531, February 4, 1907, for the relief of Francisco Krebs.
15. S. 6197, December 20, 1906, granting increase of pension to Charles E. Henry.
16. H.R. 2326, February 27, 1907, for the relief of J.W. Bauer and others.
17. H.R. 13122, March 4, 1907, to correct the military record of John Allen.

18. H.R. 22367, February 26, 1907, for the relief of Patrick Conlin.
19. H.R. 4763, April 7, 1908, transferring Commander William Wilmot White from retired list to active list of Navy.
20. H.R. 7157, February 26, 1909, for the relief of W. P. Dukes, postmaster at Rowesville, South Carolina.
21. H.R. 15098, January 27, 1909, to correct the military record of John H. Layne.
22. H.R. 16927, February 8, 1909, for the relief of Lieutenant Commander Kenneth McAlpine.

William Howard Taft

1. S. 4671, March 28, 1910, to amend the military record of Aaron Cornish.
2. S. 5752, April 4, 1910, to correct the military record of Charles J. Smith.
3. S. 10172, March 4, 1911, for the relief of Ten Eyk De Witt Veeder, Commodore on the retired list of the United States Navy.
4. H.R. 5015, January 20, 1911, for the relief of Clarence Frederick Chapman, United States Navy.
5. H.R. 30969, March 4, 1911, for the relief of William Porter White.
6. S. 67, August 24, 1912, for the relief of Captain Joseph Herring, United States Army, retired.
7. H. R. 8853, February 27, 1912, for the relief of John L. Baird.

Woodrow Wilson

1. H. J. Res. 111, October 22, 1913, to authorize the reinstatement of Adolph Unger as a cadet in the United States Military Academy.
2. H.R. 2728, August 27, 1914, for the relief of Geo. P. Heard.
2. H.R. 8272, November 5, 1919, to restore Harry Graham, captain of Infantry, to his former position on lineal list of captains of Infantry.
3. H.R. 4927, June 4, 1920, for the relief of Nancy A. Parsons, C.M. Parsons, D. F. Staggs,
Ollie Staggs, Rosa Staggs, Lena Birchfield, Alice Birchfield, Bertie Gwin, Greely Gilbert, Linville Gilbert, and Nelson Gilbert.
5. H.R. 13600, February 18, 1921, for the relief of Mrs. William B. Ryan.

Warren G. Harding

None

Calvin Coolidge

1. S. 2338, May 14, 1926, authorizing the President to reappoint Chester A. Rothwell, formerly a captain of Engineers in the United States Army, as an officer of Engineers, United States Army.
2. H.R. 4664, May 18, 1928, for the relief of Capt. George R. Armstrong, United States Army, retired.
3. H.R. 10139, May 18, 1928, for the relief of Edmund F. Hubbard.

Herbert Hoover

1. H.R. 1036, February 7, 1931, for the relief of Homer N. Horine.
2. H.R. 3368, February 23, 1931, for the relief of Joseph Marko.
3. S. 2179, February 26, 1932, for the relief of Alexander M. Proctor.

Franklin D. Roosevelt

1. S. 558, March 1, 1934, for the relief of Beryl M. McHam.
2. S. 1484, April 17, 1934, for the relief of Miles Thomas Barrett.
3. H.R. 177, May 22, 1934, for the relief of Lottie Bryant Steel.
4. H.R. 507, May 9, 1934, for the relief of John Thomas Simpkins.
5. H.R. 1870, May 9, 1934, for the relief of Corrine Blackburn Gale.
6. H.R. 2032, June 13, 1934, for the relief of Richard A. Chavis.
7. H.R. 2035, June 13, 1934, for the relief of Jennie Bruce Gallahan.
8. H.R. 2749, June 16, 1934, for the relief of E.B. Rose.
9. H.R. 3553, May 21, 1934, for the relief of Harvey O. Willis.
10. H.R. 3908, March 27, 1934, for the relief of Joanna A. Sheehan.
11. H.R. 4973, May 24, 1934, for the relief of G. C. Vandover.
12. H.R. 5542, May 21, 1934, for the relief of Joe G. McInerney.
13. H.R. 6246, June 16, 1934, granting 6 month's pay to Annie Bruce.
14. S. 274, April 12, 1935, for the relief of Charles C. Floyd.
15. S. 457, August 21, 1935, for the relief of John W. Beck.
16. S. 488, April 11, 1935, for the relief of Michael Iltz.
17. S. 1410, June 27, 1935, for the relief of Thomas G. Carlin.
18. S. 1426, August 21, 1935, providing for the appointment of Harry T. Herring, formerly, Lieutenant Colonel in the United States Army, as a lieutenant colonel in the United States Army and his retirement in that grade.
19. S. 1497, August 23, 1935, to authorize the appointment of First Lieutenant Claude W. Shelton, retired, to the grade of captain, retired, in the United States Army.
20. S. 1696, August 21, 1935, for the relief of Mary Sky Necklace.
21. H.R. 231, June 7, 1935, for the relief of Thomas M. Bardin.
22. H.R. 298, July 25, 1935, for the relief of Jack Page.
23. H.R. 617, July 24, 1935, for the relief of Lake B. Morrison.
24. H.R. 1119, July 8, 1935, for the relief of Joseph W. Harley.

25. H.R. 1565, May 13, 1935, for the relief of Frank R. Carpenter, alias Frank R. Carvin.
26. H.R. 1951, August 9, 1935, for the relief of John J. O'Connor.
27. H.R. 2128, April 18, 1835, for the relief of Rossetta Laws.
28. H.R. 2294, June 3, 1935, for the relief of Thaddeus C. Knight.
29. H.R. 2566, July 24, 1935, for the relief of Percy C. Wright.
30. H.R. 2678, April 11, 1935, for the relief of Carl L. Bernau.
30. H.R. 3071, April 26, 1935, for the relief of Second Lt. Charles E. Upson.
31. H.R. 3105, May 15, 1935, for the relief of Samuel Kaufman.
32. H.R. 4623, August 9, 1935, for the relief of George Brackett Cargill, deceased.
33. S. 166, February 17, 1936, for the relief of Jack Doyle.
34. S. 246, February 17, 1936, for the relief of Elmer Blair.
35. S. 272, February 18, 1936, for the relief of William Frank Lipps.
36. S. 713, May 5, 1936, granting jurisdiction to the Court of Claims to hear the case of David A. Wright.
37. S. 920, June 5, 1936, for the relief of Ruth J. Barnes.
38. S. 925, June 1, 1936, to carry into effect the findings of the Court of Claims in the case of William Danenhower.
39. S. 952, June 1, 1936, for the relief of Zelma Halverson.
40. S. 1110, May 7, 1936, for the relief of A. Randolph Holladay.
41. S. 1176, February 17, 1936, for the relief of Thomas A. Coyne.
42. S. 1360, June 5, 1936, for the relief of the estate of Teresa de Prevost.
43. S. 1683, March 11, 1936, for the relief of Robert L. Monk.
44. S. 1837, March 16, 1936, for the relief of W.W. Cook.
45. S. 1846, May 7, 1936, for the relief of the estate of Anton W. Fischer.
46. S. 1950, February 17, 1936, for the relief of the estate of Julius Crisler.
47. S. 3067, June 16, 1936, for the relief of A.J. Watts.
48. S. 3581, May 19, 1936, for the relief of Henry Thornton Meriwether.
49. S. 3663, June 16, 1936, for the relief William Connelly, alias William E. Connoley.
50. H.R. 399, May 5, 1936, for the relief of A.F. Amory.
51. H.R. 1867, March 4, 1936, for the relief of Orville E. Clark.
52. H.R. 2469, April 13, 1936, for the relief of Michael P. Lucas.
53. H.R. 3914, June 8, 1936, for the relief of Oscar Gustof Bergstrom.
54. H.R. 4031, May 6, 1936, for the relief of Stanley T. Gross.
55. H.R. 4086, April 13, 1936, for the relief of Ellis Duke, also known as Elias Duke.
56. H.R. 4777, March 3, 1936, to place Vincent P. Rousseau on retried list of the Army.
57. H.R. 5876, March 4, 1936, for the relief of Elmer H. Ackerson.
58. H.R. 6297, April 20, 1936, for the relief of Leon Frederick Ruggles.
60. H.R. 7092, May 6, 1936, for the relief of Percy Wright Foote, United States Navy.

61. H.R. 10785, June 16, 1936, for the relief of John B.H. Waring.
62. S. 733, June 15, 1937, to adjudicate the claim of Robert A. Watson.
63. S. 826, August 7, 1937, for the relief of the estates of Mrs. H. Lee Shelton, Mrs. J.R. Scruggs, and Mrs. Irvin Johnson.
64. S. J. Res. 30, July 19, 1937, for the relief of William K. Richardson.
65. H.R. 1114, August 17, 1937, for the relief of Agnes Ewing Harter.
66. H.R. 4156, August 20, 1937, for the relief of George R. Brown.
67. S. 1465, May 26, 1938, for the relief of Beryl M. McHam.
68. S. 2051, June 15, 1938, for the relief of John F. Fitzgerald.
69. S. J. Res. 67, January 3, 1938, to adjudicate the claim of the estate of John F. Hackfield.
70. H.R. 3657, April 13, 1938, for the relief of Albert Pina Afonso a minor.
71. H.R. 3706, April 11, 1938, for the relief of Ella Goodwin.
72. H.R. 5056, May 19, 1938, for the relief of A.R. Wickham.
73. H. R. 5603, April 12, 1938, for the relief of Peter Sietsma.
74. H.R. 5871, January 20 1938, for the relief of Ralph B. Sessoms.
75. S. 556, July 18, 1939, for the relief of Cathine Hunter.
76. H.R. 2480, August 1, 1939, for the relief of the estate of John B. Brack.
77. H.R. 2687, July 27, 1939, for the relief of Elbert R. Miller.
78. S. 217, October 25, 1940, for the relief of Charles B. Payne.
79. S. 263, March 18, 1940, for the relief of George R. Morris.
80. S. 419, September 5, 1940, for the relief of Luke A. Westenberger.
81. S. 897, June 17, 1940, to correct the military record of Walter Ballhaus.
82. S. 1009, July 9, 1940, to pension Bert W. Helmer.
83. S. 1024, June 18, 1940, for the relief of Hairiest Boswell, guardian of Better Fisher.
84. S. 1384, May 29, 1940, for the relief of Egon Karl Freiherr and Margarete von Mauchenhim.
85. S. 1560, June 21, 1940, for the relief of Amos B. Cole.
86. S. 2209, June 19, 1940, for the relief of Earle Embrey.
87. S. 2295, June 17, 1940, authorizing the President to reappoint and honorably discharged David J. Sawyer, Second Lieutenant, National Army, as of May 11, 1919.
88. S. 2413, July 16, 1940, granting a pension to Arminda Bauman.
89. S. 2433, April 12, 1940, for the relief of Frank Casey.
90. S. 2686, August 28, 1940, to authorize the reenlistment of John Mudry in the United States Army.
91. S. 3673, June 19, 1940, to allow Kurt Frings to enter and remain permanently in the United States.
92. S. 3729, December 19, 1940, for the relief of Hjalmar M. Seby.
93. S. 3769, July 16, 1940, for the relief of Jerry McKinley Thompson.
94. H.R. 428, October 10, 1940, for relief of Edward Workman.
95. H.R. 554, October 9, 1940, for the relief of Meta De Rene McLoskey.

96. H.R. 775, October 10, 1940, for relief of W. M. Hurley and Joe Whitson.
97. H.R. 1178, July 3, 1940, for relief of Lester R. Taylor.
98. H.R. 1312, June 11, 1940, to pension Ernest Francis White.
99. H.R. 1379, June 11, 1940, to pension Timothy A. Linehan.
100. H.R. 2014, July 1, 1940, for the relief of Margaret Redmond.
101. H.R. 2143, June 11, 1940, to pension Helen M. Crowley.
102. H.R. 2214, October 10, 1940, for the relief of M. Grace Murphy, administratrix of the estate of John H. Murphy, deceased.
103. H.R. 2273, June 11, 1940, granting a pension to Lizzie May Wilbur Clayton.
104. H.R. 2285, June 11, 1940, granting a pension to Maud Patterson.
105. H.R. 2487, April 22, 1940, for the relief of Krikor Haroutunian.
106. H.R. 2513, July 3, 1940, for the relief of C. B. Reagh.
107. H.R. 4142, July 2, 1940, for the relief of Mary Reid Hudson.
108. H.R. 4394, June 10, 1940, granting a pension to James G. Bailey.
109. H.R. 5007, June 11, 1940, granting a pension to John W. Swoveland.
110. H.R. 5156, July 3, 1940, for the relief of Adolph Ernest Helms.
111. H.R. 5336, December 30, 1940, for the relief of Peter Bavisotto.
112. H.R. 5592, July 2, 1940, for the relief of Vernon Atkison.
113. H. R. 5640, August 26, 1940, to admit Richard Paul Rehn permanently to the United States.
114. H.R. 5641, August 26, 1940, to admit Johann Rudolf Hueneberg permanently into the United States.
115. H.R. 6409, October 10, 1940, to record the lawful admission to the United States for permanent residence of Mtiejus Buzas and Bernice Buzas, his wife.
116. H.R. 6548, July 2, 1940, for the relief of Isobell Shanks.
117. H.R. 6681, June 11, 1940, granting a pension to Victor Gondos, Jr.
118. H.R. 6823, August 14, 1940, for the relief of Wilson A. Kramer.
119. H.R. 6891, July 3, 1940, for the relief of Anthony Borsellino.
120. H.R. 6891, July 2, 1940, for the relief of William M. Irvine.
121. H.R. 7179, October 10, 1940, to grant American citizenship to Louis D. Friedman.
122. H.R. 7563, July 3, 1940, to admit Salomon Georg Kaufman and others to the United States for permanent residence.
123. H. R. 7826, August 26, 1940, for the relief of R. F. Brazelton.
124. H.R. 8743, October 10, 1940, for the relief of Luther Haden.
124. H.R. 9520, August 14, 1940, for the relief of Edward F. Higgins, postmaster, Great Neck, New York.
125. H.R. 9651, July 2, 1940, to admit Meier Langerman and others for permanent residence in the United States.
127. S. 201, December 23, 1941, for the relief of Henry Kotila.
128. S. 302, April 14, 1941, for the relief of Clayton W. Curtis.
129. S. 514, May 19, 1941, for the relief of R. Stern.
130. S. 788, May 19, 1941, for the relief of Noland Blasse.

131. S. 829, June 19, 1941, for the relief of T. Earl Rodgers and wife.
132. S. 1027, July 30, 1941, for the relief of Harriet B. Rickards.
132. S. 1251, October 23, 1941, to amend Private Act No. 446 (76th Congress) approved July 2, 1940, relating to the relief of Charles E. Molster, J.L. Summers, and Guy F. Allen.
134. H.R. 1674, June 27, 1941, for the relief of Alfred T. Johnson.
135. H.R. 2054, June 10, 1941, to adjudicate claims of Ben White, et al.
136. H.R. 3551, July 31, 1941, for the relief of Lillian Korkemas and Rose Grazioli.
137. H.R. 3607, August 2, 1941, for the relief of Anton Waytashek.
138. H. R. 3731, November 28, 1941, for the relief of Raymond J. McMahon.
139. H.R. 4221, May 13, 1941, for the relief of Charlotte E. Hunter.
140. H.R. 4246, November 28, 1941, for the relief of Elizabeth Ayers.
141. S. 381, February 17, 1942, for the relief of Marcel M. Roman, Clara M. Roman, and Rodica E. Roman.
142. S. 819, June 26, 1942, for the relief of the widow and children of Dr. Joe M. Ferguson.
143. S. 836, May 5, 1942, for the relief of John C. Crossman.
144. S. 1033, October 19, 1942, for the relief of the estate of Robert Lee Wright.
145. S. 1143, October 19, 1942, for the relief of Dayee Jones.
146. S. 1667, July 30, 1942, for the relief of Mike Chetkovich.
147. S. 1694, July 30, 1942, for the relief of Mrs. Claud Tuck.
148. S. 1099, October 19, 1942, for the relief of Mrs. Reita M. Lary.
149. S. 2202, May 27, 1942, to reinstate Paul A. Larned, a Major, United States Army, retired, to the active list of the Regular Army.
150. S. 2364, October 19, 1942, for the relief of former First Lieutenant William J. Tepsic, 176th Field Artillery.
151. S. 2506, October 29, 1942, for the relief of Angela Skeoch.
152. S. J. Res. 24, June 11, 1942, for the relief of W. K. Richardson.
153. H.R. 902, February 6, 1942, granting an increase in pension of Elizabeth Painter Menoher.
154. H.R. 1675, December 14, 1942, for the relief of L.W. Collins.
155. H.R. 1883, December 7, 1942, for the relief of Llewella J. Welsh.
156. H.R. 2545, August 3, 1942, for the relief of Chin Hoy.
157. H.R. 3141, March 5, 1942, for the relief of Fred Farner and Doris M. Schroeder.
158. H.R. 3200, March 11, 1942, for the relief of W. M. Hurley and Joe Whitson.
159. H.R. 3403, February 17, 1942, for the relief of Louis M. McDougal.
160. H.R. 3610, March 7, 1942, for the relief of Minnie C. Sanders.
161. H.R. 3773, December 14, 1942, to adjudicate the claim of John L. Alcock.
162. H.R. 4010, March 9, 1942, for the relief of Thelma Carringer, et al.
163. H.R. 4665, April 9, 1942, for the relief of Harry Kahn.
164. H.R. 4998, February 26, 1942, for the relief of Daniel Elliott and Helen Elliott.
165. H.R. 5295, July 27, 1942, for the relief of Romano Emilion.

166. H.R. 5329, June 9, 1942, for the relief of J.W. McIntosh.
167. H.R. 5504, April 9, 1942, for the relief of H. J. Baney.
168. H.R. 5938, June 23, 1942, for the relief of A. H. Larzelere.
169. H.R. 6545, December 14, 1942, for the relief of Spencer Meeks.
170. H.R. 6781, December 14, 1942, for the relief of Frank Novak, as guardian of Lorraine Novak, a minor.
171. S. 52, April 14, 1943, for the relief of Hazel M. Lewis.
172. S. 414, June 28, 1943, for the relief of Thaddeus C. Knight.
173. S. 514, October 28, 1943, for relief of Blanche H. Karsch, administratrix of estate of Kate E. Hamilton.
174. S. 648, December 18, 1943, for the relief of Arthur C. Norcutt.
175. H.R. 1639, April 13, 1943, for the relief of Frank and Paulina Rublein and Ethel Bowers.
176. H.R. 2299, December 21, 1943, to adjudicate the claims of W.M. Hurley and Joe Whitson.
177. S. 199, March 1, 1944, for the relief of Robert Norheim.
178. S. 949, February 29, 1944, for the relief of Mrs. Anna Runnebaum.
179. S. 1090, January 31, 1944, for the relief of John Henry Miller, Jr.
180. S. 1101, December 6, 1944, for the relief of John C. Shaw, administrator, of the estate of Sydney C. McLouth, deceased.
181. H.R. 550, February 28, 1944, for the relief of the estate of Mrs. Renzie Graham.
182. H.R. 1273, March 29, 1944, for the relief of heirs of Simon M. Myhre.
183. H.R. 2075, February 28, 1944, for the relief of Charles R. Hooper.
184. H.R. 2993, March 27, 1944, for the relief of John W. Booth, III.
185. H.R. 3537, June 7, 1944, for the relief of Bessie Eason.
186. H.R. 249, March 29, 1945, for the relief of Charles R. Hooper.
187. H.R. 946, March 26, 1945, for the relief of the estates of Robert C. Meals, Mrs. Bessie Mae Morgret, Mrs. Margaret J. Meals, Ronald Meals (a minor) and Betty Wrightstone (a minor).

Harry S. Truman

1. S. 311, July 17, 1945, for the relief of Philip Kleinman.
2. H.R. 259, July 21, 1945, for the relief of Leo Gottlieb.
3. H.R. 912, July 2, 1945, for the relief of William H. Shultz.
4. H.R. 1016, May 31, 1945, for the relief of Captain Millard L. Treadwell.
5. H.R. 1303, November 12, 1945, for the relief of Daniel D. O'Connell and Almon B. Stewart.
6. H.R. 1877, May 31, 1945, for the relief of Major William Peyton Tidwell.
7. H.R. 1917, July 6, 1945, for the relief of John R. Jennings.
8. H.R. 2055, April 19, 1945, for the relief of Ben Grunstein.
10. S. 75., April 27, 1946, for the relief of Thomas G. Locke.

11. S. 1190, April 26, 1946, for the relief of Mrs. Henry H. Hay.
12. S. 1480, February 19, 1946, for the relief of Charles R. Hooper.
13. S. 1563, June 4, 1946, for the relief of Ferris Ruggles.
14. S. 1604, May 31, 1946, for the relief of Leo Stuhr.
15. H.R. 1264, April 25, 1946, for the relief of Lt. Col. John P. Maher, Field Artillery Reserve, Army of the United States.
16. H.R. 1489, March 7, 1946, for the relief of Harold B. Alden and Walter E. Strohm.
17. H.R. 1980, April 26, 1946, for the relief of Major Edward A. Zaj.
18. H.R. 2062, April 26, 1946, for the relief of Dave Topper.
19. H.R. 2579, June 15, 1946, for the relief of John G. Johnson.
20. H.R. 3003, April 26, 1946, for the relief of Mary G. Paul.
21. H.R. 3400, July 27, 1946, for the relief of Herbert W. Rogers.
22. H.R. 3480, July 27, 1946, for the relief of Miss Ruth Lois Cummings.
23. H.R. 4458, July 29, 1946, for the relief of Rosella J. Masters.
24. H.R. 4660, August 2, 1946, for the relief of Mrs. Georgia Lanser and Ensign Joseph Lanser.
25. H.R. 4716, June 15, 1946, for the relief of Charles B. Borell.
26. H.R. 6442, August 2, 1946, for the relief of Mrs. Elizabeth J. Patterson, Joy Patterson, and Roberta Patterson.
27. S. 423, June 30, 1947, for the relief of John B. Barton.
28. H.R. 617, July 2, 1947, for the relief of James Harry Martin.
29. H.R. 723, June 27, 1947, for the relief of the legal guardian of Hunter A. Hoagland, a minor.
30. H.R. 2306, July 23, 1947, for the relief of Myrtle Ruth Osborne, Marion Walts and Jessie A. Walts.
31. S. 252, June 11, 1948, for relief of the estate of Lee Jones Cardy.
32. S. 499, February 29, 1948, authorizing the issuance of a patent in fee to Mrs. Bessie Two Elk-Poor Bear.
33. S. 542, February 28, 1948, authorizing the issuance of a patent in fee to Mrs. Ella White Bull.
34. S. 939, March 15, 1948, for the relief of Charles Howard Richards.
35. S. 1307, April 20, 1948, for the relief of Edward Trapier Rogers.
36. S. 1312, May 4, 1948, for relief of Jeannette C. Jones and minor children.
37. H.R. 388, April 27, 1948, for the relief of Bert Harrington, Jr.
38. H.R. 645, January 24, 1948, for the relief of Ben W. Colburn.
39. H.R. 1152, March 20, 1948, for the relief of Mrs. Inga Patterson, widow of F.X. Patterson.
40. H.R. 1308, May 27, 1948, for the relief of H.C. Biering.
41. H.R. 1508, June 11, 1948, for the relief of Mrs. Lula Wilson Nevers.
42. H.R. 1586, April 12, 1948, for the relief of Mrs. Leslie Price, Phillip C. Price, Mrs. Louise Keyton, Annie Curry, and James Curry.
43. H.R. 2131, June 10, 1948, for relief of Fred E. Gross.

44. H.R. 2268, March 20, 1948, for the relief of Charles E. Crook and B.L. Fielder.
45. H.R. 2347, April 12, 1948, for the relief of Akiko Tsukado Miller.
46. H.R. 3061, April 12, 1948, for the relief of Victor C. Kaminski.
47. H.R. 3111, January 31, 1948, for the relief of Louis H. Deaver.
48. H. R. 3754, January 26, 1948, for the relief of Oscar and Anna Carlblom.
49. S. 40, August 5, 1949, for the relief of William D. Norris.
50. S. 146, June 21, 1949, for the relief of J. N. Jones, et al.
51. S. 275, August 5, 1949, for the relief of Arthur C. Jones.
52. S. 377, October 18, 1949, for the relief of Ernest J. Jenkins.
53. S. 1266, August 5, 1949, for the relief of Hayward O. Brandon.
54. H.R. 572, April 19, 1949, for the relief of Sylvia M. Missetich.
55. H.R. 581, April 25, 1949, for the relief of Hilda Links and E. J. Ohman, partners and Fred L. Kroesing, all of Anchorage, Alaska.
56. H. R. 594, April 25, 1949, for the relief of Mamie L. Hurley.
57. H.R. 683, October 1949, for the relief of Louise P. Lewis (Louise Peters Lewis).
58. H.R. 703, July 19, 1949, for the relief of Oteenin Foxworth.
59. H.R. 1019, October 11, 1949, for the relief of George M. Ford.
59. H.R. 1036, April 21, 1949, for the relief of R.C. Owen, Jr. and Ray Owen, *overridden*.
60. H.R. 1131, July 19, 1949, for the relief of James F. Girdley and Percy Bridgewater.
61. H.R. 1282, August 23, 1949, for the relief of Mrs. T.A. Robertson.
62. H.R. 1471, June 7, 1949, for the relief of E. La Ree Smoot.
63. H.R. 3254, October 12, 1949, for the relief of Zelma Inez Cheek.
64. H.R. 4563, October 12, 1949, for the relief of Sarah E. Thompson .
65. S. 305, August 29, 1950, for the relief of Julio Laffitte.
66. S. 1169, August 8, 1950, for the relief of Christina Shalfeieff.
67. S. 1528, December 29, 1950, for the relief of Elmer Beller.
68. S. 1800, August 29, 1950, for the relief of J. Don Alexander, Colorado Springs, Colorado.
69. S. 2297, August 14, 1950, for the relief of the estate to Lee Jones Cardy.
70. S. 2702, December 29, 1950, for the relief of Louis E. Gabel.
71. H.R. 602, August 25, 1950, for the relief of Fritz Busche.
72. H.R. 1022, August 11, 1950, for the relief of Alvin Smith, New Castle, Delaware.
73. H.R. 1026, May 15, 1950, for the relief of Susie Lee Spencer.
74. H. R. 1481, May 3, 1950, for the relief of Julius Zaffareni.
75. H.R. 3464, August 14, 1950, for the relief of John Micheal Ancker Rasmussen to record lawful admission for permanent residence.
76. H.R. 4806, August 14, 1950, for the relief of Dr. Francesco Drago.
78. H.R. 5016, August 14, 1950, for the relief of Mrs. Virginia Dalla Rosa Prati and her son Roland Dalla Rosa Prati.
79. H. R. 7540, August 23, 1950, for the relief of Louise Peter Lewis.

80. H.R. 8422, June 23 , 1950, for the relief of Carmencita von Plettenberg.
81. S. 46, March 16, 1951, for the relief of Ruth Obre Dubonnet.
82. S. 827, August 30, 1951, for the relief of Fred P. Hines.
83. H.R. 2459, October 13, 1951, for the relief of Ollie O. Evans, Jr.
84. H.R. 2771, August 27, 1951, for the relief of Lon Weaver.
85. S. 1045, May 21, 1951, for the relief of Susie Lee Spencer.

Dwight D. Eisenhower

1. S. 152, July 20, 1953, for the relief of Fred P. Hines.
2. S. 484, June 15, 1953, for the relief J. Don Alexander.
3. H.R. 1334, June 15, 1953, for the relief of Helmuth Wolf Gruhl.
4. S. 153, March 14, 1954, for the relief of Wilhelm Engelhart.
5. S. 502, March 17, 1954, for the relief of Mrs. Margareth Wiegand.
6. H.R. 898, June 14, 1954, for the relief of Mrs. Rose Kaczmarczyk.
7. H.R. 1128, June 29, 1954, for the relief of Jake Alexander.
8. H.R. 3109, June 7, 1954, for the relief of Theodore W. Carlson.
9. H.R. 3350, July 3, 1954, for the relief of Ralston Edward Harry.
10. H.R. 3733, February 23, 1954, for the relief of Mrs. Anna Holder.
11. H.R. 4532, June 7, 1954, for the relief of Mrs. Ann Elizabeth Caulk
12. H.R. 6452, June 14, 1954, for the relief of Mrs. Gazed L. St. Marie.
13. S. 143, June 3, 1955, for the relief of Kurt Glazer.
14. S. 2152, July 2, 1956, for the relief of the estate of Susie Lee Spencer.
15. H.R. 1866, June 18, 1956, for the relief of Mr. And Mrs. Thomas V. Compton.
16. H.R. 6421, April 9, 1956, for the relief of Roy Conan and others.
17. S. 1008, July 1, 1957, for the relief of Col. Benjamin Axelroad.
18. H.R. 1863, April 17, 1957, for the relief of Mrs. John William Brennan.
19. H. R. 6961, August 19, 1957, for the relief of Walter H. Berry.
20. S. 674, March 17, 1958, for the relief of Cale P. Haun and Julia Fay Haun.
21. S. 2110, March 31, 1958, for the relief of Shirley Leeke Kilpatrick.
22. H.R. 1495, February 20, 1958, for the relief of Alfred Hanzal.
23. H.R. 2647, August 12, 2958, for the relief of D. S. and Elizabeth Laney.
24. H.R. 2763, June 4, 1958, for the relief of Hong-to Dew.
25. S. 611, July 8, 1959, for the relief of Harry H. Nakamura.
26. H.R. 6023, April 11, 1960, for the relief of William J. Kaiser.
27. H. R. 1933, April 11, 1960, for the relief of Mrs. Virginia Bond.

John F. Kennedy

1. H.R. 3498, May 26, 1961, for the relief of William Joseph Vincent.
2. H.R. 4206, July 20, 1961, for the relief of Melvin H. Baker and Francis V. Baker.
3. H.R. 4640, September 1, 1961, for the relief of the estate of Charles H. Biederman.

4. S. 521, March 7, 1962, for the relief of Charles J. Utterback.
5. S. 1934, April 16, 1962, for the relief of Mrs. Chow Chui Ha.
6. H.R. 3372, August 24, 1962, for the relief of Barbara W. Tousil, Edward G. Trousil, and Robert E. Trousil.
7. H.R. 7328, September 20, 1962, for the relief of estate of Louis J. Simpson, deceased.
8. S. 1201, November 19, 1963, for the relief of Dr. James T. Maddux.

Lyndon B. Johnson

1. H.R. 4501, August 6, 1964, for the relief of Anthony F. Bernardo and Ambrose A. Cerrito.
2. H.R. 1384, October 20, 1965, for the relief of Theodore Zissu.
3. H.R. 1867, June 14, 1965, for the relief of Daniel Walter Miles.
4. H.R. 5902, October 4, 1965, for the relief of Cecil Graham.
5. H.R. 7546, October 10, 1966, for the relief of Gilmour C. MacDonald, Colonel, U.S. Air Force (retired).

References

Anonymous (1966). "Private Bills in Congress." *Harvard Law Review* 79: 1684-1706.

Berdahl, C.A. (1937). "The President's Veto of Private Bills." *Political Science Quarterly* 52: 505-531.

Beth, R. (1995). "Private Bill," in Donald Bacon et al, eds., *The Encyclopedia of the United States Congress*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1626-1627.

Copeland, G.W. 1983. "When Congress and the President Collide: Why Presidents Veto Legislation." *Journal of Politics* 45: 698-710.

Hill, J.S., and K.C. Williams (1993). "The Decline of Private Bills: Resources Allocation, Credit Claiming, and the Decision to Delegate." *American Journal of Political Science* 37: 1008-1031.

Hinds, A.C. (1907). *Hinds' Precedents of the House of Representatives of the United States*. Washington: Government Printing Office, Volume 4 of 5.

Hoff S.B. (1999). "From Conciliation to Confrontation: Clinton I and the Veto." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Midwest Political Science Association, Chicago, IL, April 15-17.

Hoff, S.B. (1992). "Presidential Support and Veto Overrides, 1889 to 1988." *Midsouth Political Science Journal* 13: 173-189.

Hoff, S.B. (2001). "Presidential Vetoes Amid Party Majorities." *National Social Science Journal* 1-20.

Hoff, S.B. (1992). "Saying No: Presidential Support and Veto Use, 1889-1988." *American Politics Quarterly* 19: 310-323.

Hoff, S. B. (1994). "The Presidential Pocket Veto: Its Use and Legality." *Journal of Policy History* 6: 188-208.

Jackson, C. (1967). *Presidential Vetoes, 1792-1945*. Athens: University of Georgia Press. Lee, J.R. (1975). "Presidential Vetoes from Washington to Nixon." *Journal of Politics* 37: 522-546.

Lewis, D.E., and J.M. Strine (1996). "What Time is It? The Use of Power in Four Different Types of Presidential Time." *Journal of Politics* 58: 682-706.

Memorandum from John Ehrlichman to Jim Keogh, Nixon Presidential Materials Project, White House Central Files, December 18, 1970.

Peabody, B.G. (1999). "Changing Dynamics of Nonjudicial Constitutional Interpretation: The Presidential Veto as a Case Study, 1789-1988." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Political Science Association, Atlanta, GA, September 2-5.

Presidential Vetoes, 1789-1988 (1992). Washington, DC: U. S. Government Printing Office.

Presidential Vetoes, 1989-1996 (1997). Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office.

Ringelstein, A.C. (1989). *The Justifications for and Policy Content of Presidential Vetoes*. Ph.D. dissertation. New Orleans: University of New Orleans.

Rohde, D. and D. Simon (1985). "Presidential Vetoes and Congressional Response: A Study of Institutional Conflict." *American Journal of Political Science* 29: 397-427.

Shields, T.G., and C. Huang (1995). "Presidential Vetoes: An Event Count Model." *Political Research Quarterly* 48: 559-572.

Simonton, D.K. (1987). "Presidential Inflexibility and Veto Behavior." *Journal of Personality* 55:1-18.

Spitzer, R. (1987). *The Presidential Veto: Touchstone of the American Presidency*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

Taylor, F.E. (1971). *An Analysis of Factors Purported to Influence the Use of, And Congressional Responses to the Use of, the Presidential Veto*. Ph.D. dissertation. Washington, DC: Georgetown University.

Watson, R. (1993). *Presidential Vetoes and Public Policy*. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas

Woolley, J.T. (1991). "Institutions, the Electoral Cycle, and the Presidential Veto." *American Journal of Political Science* 35: 279-304.

Yacker, M. (1979). "Private Bills and Federal Charters." Washington: Congressional Research Service, Report 79-1 10GOV.